

MUSLIM PERCEPTIONS AND RECEPTIONS OF THE BIBLE

RESOURCES IN ARABIC AND ISLAMIC STUDIES

series editors

Joseph E. Lowry
Devin J. Stewart
Shawkat M. Toorawa

international advisory board

Maaike van Berkel
Kristen Brustad
Antonella Ghergetti
Ruba Kana'an
Wen-chin Ouyang
Tahera Qutbuddin

Number 11

Muslim Perceptions and Receptions of the Bible:
Texts and Studies

MUSLIM PERCEPTIONS AND RECEPTIONS OF THE BIBLE: TEXTS AND STUDIES

CAMILLA ADANG *and* SABINE SCHMIDTKE

 LOCKWOOD PRESS

Atlanta, Georgia
2019

MUSLIM PERCEPTIONS AND RECEPTIONS OF THE BIBLE: TEXTS AND STUDIES

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to Lockwood Press, P.O. Box 133289, Atlanta, GA 30333, USA.

© 2019, Lockwood Press

ISBN: 978-1-948488-20-4

Library of Congress Control Number: 2019940455

Cover design by Susanne Wilhelm

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper.

Contents

| | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Series Editors' Preface | vii |
| Preface | ix |
| <i>Surveys</i> | |
| 1. Torah (C. Adang) | 1 |
| 2. Medieval Muslim Polemics against the Jewish Scriptures (C. Adang) | 15 |
| 3. Muslim-Jewish Polemics (C. Adang and S. Schmidtke) | 39 |
| <i>The Sunnī Tradition</i> | |
| 4. The Muslim Reception of Biblical Materials: Ibn Qutayba and His <i>Aqlām al-Nubuwwa</i> (S. Schmidtke) | 49 |
| 5. Some Hitherto Neglected Biblical Material in the Work of Ibn Ḥazm (C. Adang) | 73 |
| 6. A Jewish Reply to Ibn Ḥazm: Solomon b. Adret's Polemic against Islam (C. Adang) | 83 |
| 7. Abū l-Ḥusayn al-Baṣrī and His Transmission of Biblical Materials from <i>Kitāb al-Dīn wa-l-Dawla</i> by Ibn Rabban al-Ṭabarī: The Evidence from Fahr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's <i>Mafātiḥ al-Ġayb</i> (S. Schmidtke) | 113 |
| 8. Abū l-Ḥusayn al-Baṣrī on the Torah and Its Abrogation (S. Schmidtke) | 129 |
| 9. The Muslim Reception of the Bible: Al-Māwardī and His <i>Kitāb Aqlām al-Nubuwwa</i> (S. Schmidtke) | 145 |
| 10. A Fourth/Tenth Century Tunisian <i>Muftī</i> on the Sanctity of the Torah of Moses (C. Adang) | 167 |
| <i>The Šī‘ī Tradition</i> | |
| 11. The Chronology of the Israelites according to Ḥamza al-Īṣfahānī (C. Adang) | 183 |
| 12. A Rare Case of Biblical “Testimonies” to the Prophet Muḥammad in Mu‘tazilī Literature: Quotations from Ibn Rabban al-Ṭabarī’s <i>Kitāb al-Dīn</i> | |

| | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <i>wa-l-Dawla</i> in Abu l-Husayn al-Baṣrī's <i>Ġurar al-Adilla</i> , as Preserved in a Work by al-Ḥimmašī al-Rāzī (C. Adang) | 203 |
| 13. Mu'tazili Discussions of the Abrogation of the Torah: Ibn Ḥallād (Fourth/Tenth Century) and His Commentators (C. Adang and S. Schmidtke) | 229 |
| 14. Biblical Predictions of the Prophet Muḥammad among the Zaydīs of Iran (S. Schmidtke) | 249 |
| 15. Biblical Predictions of the Prophet Muḥammad among the Zaydīs of Yemen (Sixth/Twelfth and Seventh/Thirteenth Centuries) (S. Schmidtke) | 281 |
| 16. An Arabic Translation of the Pentateuch in the Library of the Twelver Šī'ī Scholar Raḍī al-Dīn ‘Alī b. Mūsā Ibn Ṭāwūs (d. 664/1266) (S. Schmidtke) | 297 |
| <i>The Ottoman World</i> | |
| 17. The Rightly Guiding Epistle (<i>al-Risāla al-Hādiya</i>) by ‘Abd al-Salām al-Muhtadī al-Muḥammadi: A Critical Edition (S. Schmidtke) | 327 |
| 18. Guided to Islam by the Torah: The <i>Risāla al-Hādiya</i> by ‘Abd al-Salām al-Muhtadī al-Muḥammadi (C. Adang) | 355 |
| 19. Ahmet b. Muştafa Ṭāşkubrīzāde's (d. 968/1561) Polemical Tract against Judaism (C. Adang and S. Schmidtke) | 371 |
| 20. A Polemic against Judaism by a Convert to Islam from the Ottoman Period: <i>Risālat Ilzām al-Yahūd fīmā za‘amū fī l-Tawrāt min qibal ‘ilm al-kalām</i> (C. Adang) | 397 |
| 21. Epistle Forcing the Jews [to Admit Their Error] with Regard to What They Contend about the Torah, by Dialectic Reasoning (<i>Risālat ilzām al-yahūd fīmā za‘amū fī l-tawrāt min qibal ‘ilm al-kalām</i>) by al-Salām ‘Abd al-‘Allām: A Critical Edition (S. Schmidtke) | 411 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | |
| Index of Personal and Group Names | 417 |
| Index of Book Titles | 455 |
| Index of Place Names | 466 |
| Index of Manuscripts | 470 |
| Index of Scriptural Passages | 473 |
| | 475 |

Series Editors' Preface

In both medieval and modern times, many Muslim scholars and laypeople alike have considered it ill-advised if not outright unlawful to consult the Hebrew Bible or the New Testament, often justifying this position through recourse to the doctrine of *taḥrīf*, “corruption of the text.” Similarly, scholars such as Ibn Kathīr (d. 774/1373) stressed the idea that one could not rely on *Isrā’iliyyāt*, “Jewish traditions,” when attempting to understand the Biblical narratives of the Qur’ān. These and other doctrinal positions represent attempts to separate Islam more starkly from Judaism and Christianity, with which it shares an obvious affinity that is textual, scriptural as much as it is doctrinal. They represent an important post-Qur’ānic development within Islam, and arguably contradict much Qur’ānic material, even if the doctrine of *taḥrīf*, for example, is attached to particular Qur’ānic prooftexts (Q Baqara 2:75; Nisā’ 4:46; Mā’ida 5:13, 41) that describe the Jews in particular as “twisting the words of God.” In context, these accusations refer to particular misrepresentations of scripture on the part of the Jews, not to the wholesale corruption of the Biblical text. To the contrary, the Qur’ān presents itself as one of God’s true scriptures, along with the Torah and the Gospel, which it regards as authentic revealed books, the contents of which are confirmed by the Qur’ān. Nevertheless, in later Islamic tradition, the accusation of *taḥrīf* came to be used as one strategy to discredit the Biblical texts that were then in the hands of Jews and Christians. Such dismissals of the Bible, however, were not universally shared in the Muslim community, and they do not reflect the complex and rich history of Muslim engagement with the Biblical text, through both Jewish and Christian sources, from the first Islamic centuries until the present day.

The studies gathered in this rich collection represent a major step forward in the study of Muslim engagement with the Bible. They focus on the Sunni tradition up to the eleventh century, on Shiite and Mu’tazili traditions from the ninth through the thirteenth centuries, and on the Ottoman tradition. Some of the texts analyzed focus on polemical topics, such as Biblical predictions of the advent of the Prophet Muḥammad that Jews and Christians are supposed to have suppressed or willfully misinterpreted, or the question of whether the Hebrew Bible has been abrogated. Others, however, adopt a more ecumenical view, arguing for the sanctity of the Hebrew Bible. Together they provide evidence of a long, complex, and profound tradition of the study, interpretation, and criticism of Biblical texts, showing that many Muslim scholars, from diverse regions and periods, had access to the Bible, whether through the personal knowledge of converts or through translations from the Jewish or Christian traditions, and furthermore, that at

least some of these scholars had a profound interest in the Bible as a sacred text, and not only as a source for polemical material.

Joseph E. Lowry
Devin J. Stewart
Shawkat M. Toorawa

Preface

The articles brought together in this volume deal with Muslim perceptions and uses of the Bible in its wider sense, including the Hebrew Bible or Old Testament as well as the New Testament, albeit with an emphasis on the former scripture. While Muslims consider the earlier revelations to the People of the Book (*ahl al-kitāb*) to have been altered to some extent by the Jews and the Christians and abrogated by the Qur’ān, God’s final dispensation to humankind, the Bible is at the same time venerated in view of its divine origin, and questioning this divine origin is tantamount to disbelief (chapter 10). Muslim scholars approached and used the Bible for a variety of purposes and in different ways, often ignoring these inherent contradictions. Thus Muslim historians regularly relied on biblical materials as their primary source for the pre-Islamic period when discussing the creation as well as the history of the Israelites and the prophets preceding Muḥammad. Authors seeking to polemicize against Jews and Christians were primarily interested in the presumed biblical annunciations of Muḥammad and his religion and/or in perceived contradictions and cases of internal abrogation in the Bible. (The latter topic is addressed in chapter 8.) These various concerns resulted from and had an impact on the ways in which Muslim authors accessed the scriptures—early historians often quote or paraphrase large sections or even entire books of the Bible—in Arabic translation—while those engaged in polemics or apologetics often resorted to lists of relevant biblical passages which must have circulated widely. The different approaches to the biblical text among Muslims with their inherent contradictions are discussed in the first section of the present book which consists of three chapters surveying Muslim attitudes to the Hebrew Bible in particular, although many of the arguments used apply equally to the New Testament.

Other studies focus on two of the earliest Muslim compilations of presumed biblical predictions of the Prophet Muḥammad: *A'lām* (or *Dalā'il*) *al-Nubuwwa* by Ibn Qutayba and *Kitāb al-Dīn wa-l-Dawla* by Ibn Rabban al-Ṭabarī, both of which were frequently consulted by later Muslim scholars. The authenticity of Ibn Rabban’s work was long disputed among Western scholars. Chapter 12, which discusses the lengthy quotations from this work by the Twelver Šī‘ī author al-Ḥimmaṣī al-Rāzī, puts the controversy to rest. This study in turn was the basis for several articles that shed additional light on the use of Ibn Rabban’s *al-Dīn wa-l-dawla* among well-known medieval Muslim scholars, such as al-Māwardī, Fahr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, and the Zaydī al-‘Ansī (chapters 7, 9, and 15). Ibn Qutayba’s influential *A'lām al-Nubuwwa* was considered for a long time to be lost, until its recent

rediscovery. A critical edition and study of the biblical passages of the work are given in chapter 4. The impact of both Ibn Rabban and Ibn Qutayba on various Sunnī, Mu'tazilī and Zaydī scholars is studied in a number of additional chapters (chapters 5, 13, 14, 15). The use of biblical passages for polemical purposes is the primary concern also of the studies brought together in the final section of this book (chapters 17–21) which focusses on the polemical works of a number of Ottoman scholars, who also adduced material from the later Jewish exegetical tradition. That Muslim polemics against the Bible elicited reactions on the part of the People of the Book is shown by the example of Rabbi Solomon ibn Adret, who wrote a refutation of Ibn Ḥazm (chapter 6).

Focusing on the long-neglected Šī'ī tradition also proved fruitful in the case of Rađī al-Dīn Ibn Ṭāwūs whose library included a copy of the Pentateuch, which is analyzed in chapter 16. The use of biblical material in the chronography of Ḥamza al-Isfahānī, who was in all likelihood a Shi'ī, is studied in chapter 11.

The chapters of this book are revised and updated versions of the following articles:

Chapter 1: "Torah," in: Jane Dammen McAuliffe (ed.), *Encyclopaedia of the Qur'an*, vol. 5. Leiden: Brill, 2006, pp. 300–311 (C. Adang);

Chapter 2: "Medieval Muslim Polemics against the Jewish Scriptures," in: Jacques Waardenburg (ed.), *Muslim Perceptions of Other Religions: A Historical Survey*. New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999, pp. 143–159 (C. Adang);

Chapter 3: "Polemics (Muslim-Jewish)," in: Norman Stillman et al. (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Jews in the Islamic World*, vol. 4. Leiden: Brill, 2010, pp. 82–90 (C. Adang & S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 4: "The Muslim Reception of Biblical Materials: Ibn Qutayba and his *A'lām al-nubuwwa*," *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 22 (2011), pp. 249–274 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 5: "Some Hitherto Neglected Biblical Material in the Work of Ibn Hazm," *Al-Masaq. Studia Arabo-Islamica Mediterranea* 5 (1992), pp. 17–28 (C. Adang);

Chapter 6: "A Jewish Reply to Ibn Ḥazm: Solomon b. Adret's Polemic against Islam," in: Maribel Fierro (ed.), *Judíos y musulmanes en al-Andalus y el Magreb: Contactos intelectuales*. Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2002, pp. 179–209 (C. Adang);

Chapter 7: "Abū al-Ḥusayn al-Baṣrī and His Transmission of Biblical Materials from *Kitāb al-dīn wa-al-dawla* by Ibn Rabban al-Ṭabarī: The Evidence from Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's *Mafatīḥ al-ghayb*," *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 20 (2009), pp. 105–118 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 8: "Abū al-Ḥusayn al-Baṣrī on the Torah and Its Abrogation," *Mélanges de l'Université Saint Joseph* 61 (2008), pp. 559–580 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 9: "The Muslim Reception of the Bible: al-Māwardī and His *Kitāb A'lām al-Nubuwwa*," in: Carmela Baffioni, Rosa Bianca Finazzi, Anna Passoni Dell'Acqua, Emidio Vergani (eds.), *Le Sacre Scritture e le loro interpretazioni*. Milan: Veneranda Biblioteca Ambrosiana; Rome: Bulzoni, 2015, pp. 71–97 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 10: “A Fourth/Tenth Century Tunisian Muftī on the Sanctity of the Torah of Moses,” in: Nahem Ilan (ed.), *The Intertwined Worlds of Islam: Essays in Memory of Hava Lazarus-Yafeh*. Jerusalem: Ben-Zvi Institute, 2002, pp. vii–xxxiv. Reprinted in Maribel Fierro (ed.), *Orthodoxy and Heresy in Islam [Critical Concepts in Islamic Studies]*, 4 vols., London, New York: Routledge, 2014, vol. 4, pp. 35–54 (C. Adang);

Chapter 11: “The Chronology of the Israelites according to Ḥamza al-Īṣfahānī,” *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 32 (2006), pp. 286–310 (C. Adang);

Chapter 12: “A Rare Case of Biblical ‘Testimonies’ to the Prophet Muhammad in Mu‘tazilī Literature: Quotations from Ibn Rabban al-Ṭabarī’s *Kitāb al-Dīn wa-l-Dawla* in Abu l-Ḥusayn al-Baṣrī’s *Għurar al-Adilla*, as Preserved in a Work by al-Ḥimmašī al-Rāzī,” in: Camilla Adang, Sabine Schmidtke and David Sklare (eds.), *A Common Rationality: Mu‘tazilism in Islam and Judaism*. Würzburg: Ergon (2007), pp. 297–330 (C. Adang);

Chapter 13: “Mu‘tazilī Discussions of the Abrogation of the Torah: Ibn Ḥallād (4th/10th Century) and His Commentators,” *Arabica* 60 (2013), pp. 701–742 (C. Adang & S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 14: “Biblical Predictions of the Prophet Muhammad among the Zaydīs of Iran,” *The Neglected Šī‘ites: Studies in the Legal and Intellectual History of the Zaydīs = Arabica. Journal of Arabic and Islamic Studies* 59 iii–iv (2012), pp. 218–266 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 15: “Biblical Predictions of the Prophet Muhammad among the Zaydīs of Yemen (6th/12th and 7th/13th centuries),” *Orientalia Christiana Analecta* 293 (2013), pp. 221–240 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 16: “Notes on an Arabic translation of the Pentateuch in the Library of the Twelver Shī‘ī Scholar Raḍī al-Dīn ‘Alī b. Mūsā ibn Ṭāwūs (d. 664/1266),” *Shii Studies Review* 1 (2017), pp. 72–129 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 17: “The Rightly Guiding Epistle (*al-Risāla al-Hādiya*) by ‘Abd al-Salām al-Muhtadī al-Muhammadī: A Critical Edition,” *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 36 (2009), pp. 439–470 (S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 18: “Guided to Islam by the Torah: The *Risāla al-Hādiya* by ‘Abd al-Salām al-Muhtadī al-Muhammadī,” in: Camilla Adang and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *Contacts and Controversies between Muslims, Jews and Christians in the Ottoman Empire and Pre-Modern Iran*, Würzburg: Ergon, 2010, pp. 57–71 (C. Adang);

Chapter 19: “Ahmad b. Muṣṭafā Ṭāshkubrīzāde’s (d. 968/1561) Polemical Tract against Judaism,” *Al-Qanṭara. Revista de Estudios Árabes* 29 (2008), pp. 79–113, 537–538 (C. Adang and S. Schmidtke);

Chapter 20: “A Polemic against Judaism by a Convert to Islam from the Ottoman Period: *Risālat Ilzām al-Yahūd fīmā za‘amū fī l-Tawrāt min qibal ‘ilm al-kalām*,” *Journal Asiatique* 297 (2009), pp. 131–151 (C. Adang);

Chapter 21: “Epistle Forcing the Jews [to Admit Their Error] with Regard to What They Contend about the Torah, by Dialectic Reasoning (*Risālat ilzām al-yahūd fīmā za‘amū fī l-tawrāt min qibal ‘ilm al-kalām*) by al-Salām ‘Abd al-‘Allām: A Critical Edition,” in Camilla Adang and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *Contacts and Controversies between Muslims, Jews and Christians in the Ottoman Empire and Pre-Modern Iran*. Würzburg: Ergon, 2010, pp. 73–82 (S. Schmidtke).

Since several of the articles included in the present volume deal with the same themes and often even with the same authors, a certain amount of overlap was inevitable. We have chosen not to rewrite the contributions, but where necessary to update references. All references have been brought together in a unified bibliography at the end of this volume, and a single system of transliteration and annotation has been used throughout. No attempt has been made to provide a comprehensive account of Muslim perceptions and receptions of the Bible.

We wish to thank the Ben-Zvi Institute, Brill, Casa de Velázquez, Ergon, I. B. Tauris, The Max Schloessinger Memorial Foundation, Orientalia Christiana Analecta, Oxford University Press, Al-Qanṭara, Routledge, the Société Asiatique, Taylor & Francis, Université Saint Joseph, as well as the Veneranda Biblioteca Ambrosiana for granting us permission to include these articles in the present volume.

Both authors benefited greatly from the comments and suggestions of colleagues during the time of writing, namely Hassan Ansari, Frédéric Bauden, Yaron Ben-Naeh, İlker Evrim Binbaş, Patricia Crone, Omid Hoseini Nezhad, Morteza Kariminiya, Nevzet Kaya, George Kiraz, Etan Kohlberg, Eva-Maria Lika, Pierre Lory, Wilferd Madelung, Yasin Meral, Judith Pfeiffer, Ahmad Reza Rahimi Rīseh, Gregor Schwab, David Sklare, Jan Thiele, Roberto Tottoli, Philippe Vallat, and Nükhet Varlik. Our work on the Muslim reception of the Bible also benefited immensely during our joint and individual work within the framework of the European Research Council FP7 project “Rediscovering Theological Rationalism in the Medieval World of Islam” and, later on, within the research project “Biblia Arabica. The Bible in Arabic among Jews, Christians and Muslims,” which was funded by the DFG in the framework of the “Deutsch-Israelische Projektkooperation” (DIP) program. We are indebted to our colleagues and collaborators in the Biblia Arabica project, especially to Miriam L. Hjälm, Juan Pedro Monferrer Sala, Meira Polliack, Alexander Treiger, and Ronny Vollandt.

Lastly, a special word of thanks is due to Hanna Siurua for her meticulous copy editing of the entire volume; to Joseph Lowry, Devin Stewart, and Shawkat Toorawa, the editors of the Resources in Arabic and Islamic Studies series, for agreeing to publish this volume in the series, and to Billie Jean Collins of Lockwood Press for seeing it through the press.